Changing Nature of Warfare: Implications for National Security of Pakistan and Way Forward

Areej Pervaiz*

Abstract

The evolving dynamics of warfare between India and Pakistan are emblematic of the broader shifts in global conflict paradigms, driven by technological advancements, geopolitical changes, and strategic innovations. This paper explores the transformation of warfare in the India-Pakistan context, with a focus on the implications of nuclear deterrence, military doctrines, and technological progressions for regional security. Employing a qualitative methodology, the study examines various aspects of the shifting warfare paradigms, including kinetic and non-kinetic warfare, hybrid warfare theory, and the impact of these changes on the national security landscape of Pakistan. The analysis is rooted in an exploration of secondary data sources, including academic journals, reports, and articles, offering a comprehensive overview of India's evolving military capabilities and strategic postures, and their implications for National Security of Pakistan. The research underscores the significance of understanding these evolving dynamics for policymakers and practitioners tasked with maintaining regional stability and preventing conflict in South Asia.

Key Words

Hybrid Warfare, India-Pakistan Relations, Asymmetric Tactics, Military Paradigms, Adaptive Defense Strategies

^{*}Areej Pervaiz has achieved her M. Phil Degree in Strategic Studies from National Defence University, Islamabad. She can be reached at areejpervaiz4@gmail.com.

Introduction

The evolution of warfare throughout history has been marked by dynamic changes, driven by advancements in technology and shifts in geopolitical landscapes. In the 21st century, characterized by rapid technological progress and global interconnectedness, traditional concepts of armed conflict are being replaced by new paradigms. These changes challenge established norms and introduce innovative concepts that reshape the essence of war. This transformation questions long-held beliefs, such as Clausewitz's assertion that violence is the fundamental aspect of warfare, highlighting the complex and multifaceted nature of modern conflicts. ¹

Modern updates in the realm of conflict have ushered in a transformative era. For instance, consider example of economic warfare as it involves state competition without direct violence, yet it possesses the potential to bring about substantial destruction and human losses, ultimately crippling a nation. Similarly, the advent of information warfare and data-centric conflicts, propaganda wars, and other non-traditional forms of engagement further exemplify this departure from conventional warfare. Consequently, scholars contend that not only is war transforming, but its very nature is undergoing a paradigm shift, while others argue that it is the characteristics of war that are adapting to the demands of a changing environment, necessitating the development of new tactics.²

The post-World War II era witnessed a shift in warfare dynamics, marked by limited, meticulously calibrated conflicts influenced by advanced weaponry and public opinion. This transformation, driven by the pervasive influence of information technology, has redefined the nature of war, emphasizing its strategic and technological evolution. There are number of studies conducted on the topic.³

The paper authored by Tahir Mahmood Azad and Muhammad Waqas Haider examines grey zone warfare dynamics, with a focus on deterrence, using the Pakistan-India conflict as an example. The authors highlight the necessity of comprehensive strategies to deter sub-threshold aggressors. While nuclear deterrence has been effective against interstate wars, it may not suffice

¹Olivia Garard, "The Objective Value of Clausewitz," *The Strategy Bridge.Org*, May 17, 2016, https://thestrategybridge.org/the-bridge/2016/5/17/the-objective-value-of-clausewitz.

²Gerard Roncolato, "The Character of War Is Constantly Changing," *U.S. Naval Institute*, May 1, 2022, https://www.usni.org/magazines/proceedings/2022/may/character-war-constantly-changing.

³ Warren Chin, "Technology, War and the State: Past, Present and Future," *International Affairs* 95, no. 4 (2019): 765-783.

against grey zone activities. They stress the importance of understanding grey zone warfare for crafting effective deterrence strategies, advocating for a nuanced approach inclusive of developing countries' experiences.⁴

Furthermore, Abbasi and Uzzaman's book examines evolving warfare dynamics between India and Pakistan, focusing on advanced nuclear technologies and disruptive innovations. They highlight the complexity added by nuclear submarines, Ballistic Missile Defense Systems (BMDs), Multiple Independently Targeted Re-Entry Vehicles (MIRVs), Anti-Satellite Weapons (ASAT), hypersonic weapons, Artificial Intelligence (AI), Lethal Autonomous Weapon Systems (LAWs), Unmanned Aerial Vehicle (UAVs)/drones, and cyber technologies. India's shift towards compellence tactics, particularly smart and surgical strikes, challenges deterrence stability, prompting considerations on regulating AI and disruptive technology militarization for future conflict management.⁵

Anand in his article asserts that warfare is evolving due to technological, geopolitical, and economic factors, transitioning from total to limited warfare in the information age. He highlights the significance of nuclear deterrence in preventing major conflicts in the subcontinent. An anticipated future war may combine industrial and information age elements, necessitating integrated structures and recognition of post-modern warfare challenges for success.⁶

Ahmad highlights the persistent lack of strategic stability in Indo-Pakistan relations despite nuclear development. He predicts future warfare in the region to involve joint and irregular scenarios, requiring Pakistan to balance conventional and nuclear forces to counter India's dominance and prevent "limited war." This underscores the complex geopolitical challenges shaped by stateless wars, nuclear weapons, and regional complexities.⁷

Masood Ur Rehman Khattak, Muhammad Khan, and Ghulam Qumber highlighted how Indian military doctrine, particularly the Cold Start Doctrine (CSD), disrupted deterrence stability, leading Pakistan to develop low-yield nuclear weapons. India responded with sub-conventional tactics like surgical strikes, prompting Pakistani anticipation of massive retaliation. India then

⁴ Tahir Mahmood Azad and Muhammad Waqas Haider, "Deterrence in Realm of Grey Zone Warfare," *Journal of Indian Studies* 6, no. 2 (2020), 304.

⁵ Rizwana Abbasi and Muhammad Saeed Uzzaman, "Changing Patterns of Warfare Between India and Pakistan: Navigating the Impact of New and Disruptive Technologies," *Taylor & Francis*, 2023.

⁶ Vinod Anand, "Warfare in transition and the Indian subcontinent," Strategic Analysis 23, no. 5 (1999), 718.

⁷ Brig Najeeb Ahmad, "Future of War and Strategy: Indo-Pak Dynamics," *IPRI Journal* XV, no. 1 (2015).

adopted hybrid warfare to exploit Pakistan's vulnerabilities, showcasing continuous adjustments in response to effective counter-maneuvering.⁸

Zulfiqar Khan warns of the perilous threat to strategic stability in South Asia from India and Pakistan's escalatory strategies. He highlights India's aggressive conventional and nuclear stance, exacerbated by its alignment with the US Indo-Pacific strategy.⁹

The paper discusses the rise of fifth-generation warfare, highlighting Pakistan's vulnerability to cyber-attacks and disinformation campaigns. Adversaries have shifted to soft power tactics since Pakistan's nuclear development, utilizing media and the internet to tarnish its image. The focus is on Pakistan's experience and the necessity for a robust counterstrategy, without addressing India's evolving war strategy.¹⁰

Dr. Asma S. Khawaja, Junaid Jhandad, and Nouman Mubarik in their article examine the evolving nature of warfare, noting a shift towards complex security environments with advancements in technology. In the context of India-Pakistan relations, hybrid warfare tactics, including conventional military operations, diplomatic pressure, fake news dissemination, propaganda, and hydro warfare, pose multifaceted challenges for Pakistan's national security amid the nuclear deterrence dynamic.¹¹

The article discusses India's doctrinal shifts aimed at Pakistan due to significant military disparities, potentially creating a security dilemma. Pakistan is urged to bolster its defense industry, enhance surveillance, and monitor India's strategic developments closely. It advocates for consistent dialogue between India and Pakistan to address outstanding issues and ensure long-term peace in South Asia.¹²

This research aims to fill a gap in existing literature by analyzing India's evolving warfare tactics, focusing on cyber security, media influence, and the connection between doctrinal changes and hybrid warfare against Pakistan. It seeks to offer insight into the complexities of warfare and its impact on India-Pakistan relations amid geopolitical shifts. In this context, it is vital to

⁸ M. U. Khattak, Muhammad Khan, and Ghulam Qumber, "Evolution of New Indian Military Strategy: Implications for Pakistan," *Margalla Papers* 23, no. 1 (2019), 139.

⁹ Zulfqar Khan, "Military Strategies of India and Pakistan: A Perspective," Strategic Thought 3 (2021), 146.

¹⁰ Anjum Bibi and Humaira Meer, "Fifth Generation War against Pakistan: Its Dynamics, Implications and Response by State Institutions," *Review of Education, Administration & Law* 6, no. 1 (2023), 50.

¹¹Nouman Mubarik, Junaid Jhandad, and Asma Shakir Khawja, "Indian Hybrid Warfare in Pakistan: Spin off Ramifications for Pakistan's National Security," *Journal of Indian Studies* 7, no. 1 (2021), 122.

¹² Ms. Kokab Al-Saba and Noor Fatima, "Doctrinal Shift in the Indian Army After 2018: Implications for Pakistan," *NDU Journal* 37 (2023), 24.

understand how have the changing dynamics of warfare between India and Pakistan evolved over time, considering the historical tension between the two nations? How do nuclear deterrence, military doctrines, and technological advancements influence the security landscape of Pakistan in the face of changing warfare dynamics with India? How does the contemporary role of Indian hybrid warfare, encompassing cyber-attacks and information warfare, impact Pakistan's national security?

To find answer of the questions, this study adopts the qualitative methodology, focusing on analyzing the shifting warfare paradigms in India. The study employs an exploratory research design, utilizing content analysis with a focus on secondary data sources, including journals, reports, articles, newspapers, and conference papers, to investigate the subject matter. ¹³

In the following sections, this study offers a comprehensive exploration of the evolving dynamics of warfare between India and Pakistan, with a focus on the transition from traditional kinetic warfare to complex hybrid warfare tactics, underscored by advancements in military technologies, doctrines, and strategies. Furthermore, it provides an in-depth analysis of the multifaceted security challenges posed by India's military modernization, including developments in missile technology, space capabilities, cyber warfare, and the strategic implications of doctrines such as the CSD. The organization of the study guides through the kinetic and non-kinetic aspects of warfare, the national security implications for Pakistan, and the strategic recalibration required to address these challenges.

Hybrid Warfare Theory

In twenty-first century, the nature of warfare has undergone a significant transformation. Rather than relying on traditional declarations of war and conventional military actions, conflicts are now frequently instigated by covert agents utilizing a diverse array of tools and strategies. These strategies aim to avoid clear attribution and potential retribution, contributing to the complexity and ambiguity of contemporary conflict scenarios.¹⁴

Hoffman's concept of hybrid warfare emphasizes the fusion of conventional and unconventional (Kinetic and Non-Kinetic) tactics, challenging traditional war and peace boundaries. State actors

¹³ What is qualitative research?" *University of Texas Arlington Libraries* (December 2023), https://libguides.uta.edu/quantitative_and_qualitative_research/qual.

¹⁴ Waseem Ahmad Qureshi, "The Rise of Hybrid Warfare," *Notre Dame Journal of International and Comparative Law* 10 (2020), 173.

blend military, economic, cyber, and informational means to achieve objectives. The Crimea annexation and Ukraine conflict illustrate this complexity, showcasing how a mix of tactics is utilized to achieve strategic aims in hybrid warfare scenarios. ¹⁵

In the context of 21st century, the integrated model of hybrid warfare has emerged, serving as inspiration for the fanatical regime in India to employ it against Pakistan. According to Pakistani perspective, through a combination of conventional and unconventional methods India is engaged in a hybrid warfare campaign aimed at destabilizing Pakistan and diminishing its increasing significance in regional dynamics.¹⁶

India's hybrid warfare against Pakistan exploits socio-ethnic and religious divisions, employing fake news dissemination and diverse tactics. Shifted from unsuccessful conventional and nuclear coercion post-nuclearization, India seeks to achieve its national security objectives vis-à-vis Pakistan through sustained efforts. Utilizing fifth-generation ammunition and information warfare, India's strategy aims to achieve its security objective vis-à-vis Pakistan, acknowledging the ineffectiveness of conventional methods and resorting to a blend of conventional and non-conventional means.¹⁷

Evolution of Warfare Between India and Pakistan

The dynamics of warfare between India and Pakistan have evolved significantly over the years, influenced by technological advancements, geopolitical shifts, and changes in military strategy. Both countries have a long history of conflict, primarily over the disputed region of Kashmir, and have fought several wars since gaining independence from British rule in 1947. The study provides a comprehensive analysis of the development and modernization of India's kinetic warfare capabilities, focusing on advancements in technology, military strategies, and collaboration with private and international partners. It explores the evolution of India's military doctrine, highlighting the implementation of the CSD, advancements in missile technology, and efforts to enhance space capabilities through increased involvement of the private sector and strategic international collaborations.

^{15 &}quot;War in Ukraine, "Center (October 2023), https://www.cfr.org/global-conflict-tracker/conflict/conflict-ukraine.

¹⁶ Muhammad Usman Askari and Lal Khan Niazi, "Indian Hybrid War against Pakistan: A Strategic Theory Perspective," *Journal of Indian Studies* 8, no. 1 (2022), 208.

¹⁷ Nisar Maaz, "5 GW and hybrid warfare: its implications and response options," (2018).

¹⁸ "Conflict between India and Pakistan," *Global Conflict Tracker*, Council on Foreign Relations, June 28, 2023. https://cfr.org/global-conflict-tracker/conflict/between-india-and-pakistan.

The analysis underscores India's significant investments in modernizing its Army, Air Force, and Naval assets, including the procurement of advanced weaponry, aircraft, and missile defense systems. Furthermore, the document delves into India's strategic use of non-kinetic warfare techniques, such as supporting insurgencies across borders, leveraging information warfare, and enhancing cyber capabilities, to augment its regional security posture and influence. This multifaceted approach reflects India's commitment to maintaining a formidable military presence and adapting to contemporary warfare challenges.¹⁹

Kinetic Warfare

The employment of physical force to harm or destroy enemy objectives is commonly referred to as kinetic warfare. It relies on conventional weapons that leverage kinetic energy to inflict damage, encompassing bullets, bombs, rockets, and artillery rounds. The hallmark of kinetic warfare is direct physical combat and devastation, distinct from cyber, electronic, or psychological warfare. It embodies conventional military doctrine, postulating that the optimal strategy for victory involves the destruction of the adversary and their infrastructure.²⁰

■ Indian Kinetic Warfare Capabilities

Firstly, in Kinetic warfare domain, India's technological advancements and military modernization efforts has a potential to create a gap in conventional military capabilities. This could influence the regional balance of power and potentially affect Pakistan's strategic calculus. India is in the process of designing an autonomous, jet-powered stealth unmanned combat air vehicle (UCAV) with a potential readiness for deployment by 2025. India is also pursuing limited warfare Strategies. After Operation Parakram's failure in 2001-2002, India pursued the CSD to avoid the nuclear threshold. India's advancements in space technology, including its ASAT capabilities could be viewed as a potential threat.

¹⁹Muhammad Ayaz Nazar, "Military Modernization: Transforming Strategic Outlay of India," *South Asia Journal* (blog), October 16, 2018, http://southasiajournal.net/military-modernization-transforming-strategic-outlay-of-india/. ²⁰ Jan Almäng, "War, Vagueness, and Hybrid War," *Defence Studies* 19, no. 2 (2019), 204.

²¹"India developing unmanned combat air vehicles," *Indo-Pacific Defense Forum* (2023), https://ipdefenseforum.com/2023/08/india-developing-unmanned-combat-air-vehicles/.

²² S. Kalyanaraman, "Operation Parakram: An Indian Exercise in Coercive Diplomacy," *Strategic Analysis* 26, no. 4 (October 1, 2002): 478–92, https://doi.org/10.1080/09700160208450063.

²³ Kelsey Davenport, "Indian ASAT Test Raises Space Risks," *The Arms Control Association*, May 2019. https://www.armscontrol.org/act/2019-05/news/indian-asat-test-raises-space-risks.

Furthermore, India is developing and deploying a variety of short to medium-range ballistic missiles, including Prithvi, Agni, Agni II, Agni III, and the forthcoming Agni Prime - characterized by its canisterized MIRV capability, offering a range of 2,000 km - are deployed. Moreover, short-range missiles such as Prahar, Pralay, and the canisterized Shourya are operational. In addition, India possesses cruise missiles such as BrahMos, alongside ongoing development efforts for Nirbhay and K-15. These missile systems, distinguished by their specific ranges, are primarily oriented towards addressing security concerns vis-à-vis Pakistan.

With missile technology, India is also working on enhancing its space power. ²⁴ Firstly, India is involving private space players in the domain of space. The new space strategy in India involves increased involvement of the private sector, allowing firms to engage in various space operations, construct infrastructure, and offer services on a national and global scale. Key players like Larsen & Toubro, Nelco (Tata Group), and MapmyIndia are founding members of the Indian Space Association (IsPA), indicating growing collaboration between the government and commercial entities. This partnership aims to enhance India's space capabilities, including military applications, as highlighted by the Russia-Ukraine conflict. Integration of commercial space innovations with military strategies is seen as crucial for addressing contemporary warfare challenges and staying abreast of global advancements. ²⁵

Secondly, it is augmenting its space capabilities with the help of international players such as the US. America's support in bolstering India's space capabilities, particularly in military space technology, stems from their shared concern about China's growing influence. India's inclusion in various export control regimes like the Missile Technology Control Regime (MTCR)²⁶, Wassenaar Arrangement²⁷, and Strategic Trade Authorization Act-1²⁸ showcases its growing international standing. Additionally, agreements such as the Indo-US Basic Exchange Cooperation and India's

²⁴ Ejaz Haider, "Missiles and Machinations: Dealing with India's Threat," *DAWN.COM*, November 5, 2023. https://www.dawn.com/news/1786490.

²⁵ Zohaib Altaf and Nimrah Javed, "Collaboration between Indian Government and Private Space Companies: Challenges for Pakistan," Think Tank Website, South Asian Voices, June 15, 2023. https://southasianvoices.org/collaboration-between-indian-government-and-private-space-companies/.

²⁶ Ghazala Yasmin Jalil, "India's Membership of Missile Technology Control Regime," *Strategic Studies* 37, no. 3 (2017), 54.

²⁷Martand Jha, "India and the Wassenaar Arrangement," *Mint*, February 5, 2018.

²⁸"India Elevated to Strategic Trade Authorization - 1 List," *Drishti IAS* (August 2018), https://www.drishtiias.com/daily-news-analysis/india-elevated-to-strategic-trade-authorization-1-List.

membership²⁹ in these export control regimes hint at India's potential ascent as a significant space power in the foreseeable future. The collaboration between India and the US in space endeavors is primarily aimed at countering China's advancements in space technology.³⁰

The Indian Army has undergone rapid modernization in recent years, focusing on self-sustained upgrades, maintenance support, and the integration of advanced technologies. This includes the replacement of vintage INSAS Rifles with SIG716 Assault Rifles, the introduction of 7.62 x 51mm Negev LMGs to replace INSAS LMGs, and the ongoing induction of modern 5.56 x 45mm CQB Carbines to replace vintage 9mm Carbines. ³¹

Moreover, the deployment of .338 Cal SAKO TRG 42 Sniper Rifles has significantly enhanced long-range precision engagement capabilities. Plans are underway for the joint production of AK-203 Assault Rifles, alongside the adoption of Multi-Mode Hand Grenades to replace Hand Grenade Number 36. Artillery modernization is prioritizing mediumization and enhancing long-range firing platforms, with efforts aligned with the 'Atmanirbhar Bharat' initiative. ³²

The Army Aviation branch is set to induct Light Combat Helicopters (LCH) and Apache Attack helicopters in the next few years. Mechanized Infantry modernization involves replacing outdated equipment with futuristic platforms and enhancing existing capabilities through upgrades. Army Air Defence equipment is being upgraded, with plans for the procurement of Very Short-Range Air Defence Systems (VSHORADS) and Light Tanks. The procurement process for Light Tanks has commenced, receiving responses from both Indian and foreign vendors, while additional orders for Arjun tanks and the induction of T-90 tanks are also progressing.³³

Indian Airforce is also undergoing modernization, as a component of the Indian Air Force's modernization strategy, the Ministry of Defence finalized a contract worth Rs 48,000 crore with Hindustan Aeronautics Limited (HAL) for the acquisition of 83 Tejas jets. Additionally, the Indian

²⁹ "India-US Basic Exchange and Cooperation Agreement (BECA): Implications for the South Asian Region on 11th November 2020," *Strategic Vision Institute* (November 2020), https://thesvi.org/svi-webinar-panel-discussion-india-us-basic-exchange-and-cooperation-agreement-beca-implications-for-the-south-asian-region/.

³⁰Munazza Khalid, "India-US Space Cooperation: Implications for the South Asian Strategic Stability," *Journal of Humanities, Social and Management Sciences (JHSMS)* 2, no. 2 (2021), 66.

³¹"Strengthening Our Military Capabilities and Developing Cyber, Space and Strategic Communications Is an Undeniable Requirement," 2022. https://www.spslandforces.com/story/?id=788&h=Strengthening-our-Military-Capabilities-and-Developing-Cyber-Space-and-Strategic-Communications-is-an-Undeniable-Requirement.

^{32 &}quot;Strengthening Our Military Capabilities and Developing Cyber, Space and Strategic Communications Is an Undeniable Requirement," accessed February 11, 2024, https://www.spslandforces.com/story/?id=788&h=Strengthening-our-Military-Capabilities-and-Developing-Cyber-Space-and-Strategic-Communications-is-an-Undeniable-Requirement.

33 Ibid.

Air Force has acquired 36 Rafale jets to bolster its combat capabilities.³⁴ India plans to operationally deploy its own long range missile defense system by 2028-2029. With it, it has acquired missile defense system S-400 from Russia.³⁵

CSD is an Indian military strategy aimed at addressing delays in responding to threats along its western border with Pakistan. It mirrors Israeli tactics seen in Lebanon, combining blitzkrieg offensive elements with US strategies from Iraq, blending Information Centric Warfare and Shockand-Awe tactics. Its goal is to maintain constant motion, keeping adversaries off-balance and complicating responses.³⁶ India's military posture and strategic doctrines, including Cold Start, have influenced regional security dynamics, shaping the discourse around the potential for military conflicts in South Asia.³⁷

India's CSD, conceived in 2004, saw delayed implementation until 2017. Now, Integrated Battle Groups (IBGs) are poised to activate Cold Start by enabling limited offensives. IBGs reduce the time between crisis and conflict, potentially surpassing past surgical strikes. Involving thousands of troops, IBGs blur the line between sub-conventional and conventional actions, raising the likelihood of conventional escalation.³⁸

IBGs promote jointness by integrating units from different branches of the armed forces. This collaborative approach ensures seamless coordination between the army, navy, and air force, enhancing overall military effectiveness. By streamlining the command and control structure, IBGs aim to reduce logistical dependencies and enhance the self-sufficiency of military formations, enabling them to operate more independently.³⁹

The transformation in India's military doctrine poses a challenge to South Asia's strategic stability post-nuclearization. Pakistan responded with Full Spectrum Deterrence (FSD), hindering CSD implementation. Surgical strikes by India faced deterrence, exemplified by the failed 2020

³⁴ Nikunj Dalmia, "IAF Working on Phasing out Remaining Three Squadrons of MiG-21 Jets," *The Economic Times*, May 8, 2023, https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/defence/iaf-working-on-phasing-out-remaining-threesquadrons-of-mig-21-jets/articleshow/100078558.cms?from=mdr.

Rajat Pandit, "India Aims to Deploy Indigenous Long-Range Air Defence System by 2028-2029," The Times of India, October 31, 2023, https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/india-aims-to-deploy-desi-iron-dome-by-2028-2029/articleshow/104806572.cms.

³⁶Sannia Abdullah, "Cold Start in Strategic Calculus," *IPRI Journal* 12, no. 1 (2012), 27.

³⁷ Sarah Faraz, "Cold Start Doctrine: The Idea of Limited Scale War & South Asian Insecurity."

³⁸ Ibid, 19.

³⁹ "Army: Planning to Convert Our Battle Squads into Integrated Battle Groups: Army Chief," The Economic Times (January 2023), https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/defence/planning-to-convert-our-battle-squads-intointegrated-battle-groups-army-chief/articleshow/97007191.cms.

airstrike post-Kashmir convoy attack.⁴⁰ Events like Kargil conflict prompted India's shift towards limited war strategies, risking regional security. Transitioning from Cold Start to surgical strikes introduces complexities in India-Pakistan dynamics. Indian planners view surgical strikes as acceptable, while Pakistan vows massive retaliation. ⁴¹

India has adopted a hybrid warfare strategy, exploiting Pakistan's vulnerabilities socio-economically, ethno-religiously, and politically for strategic gains.⁴² Limited wars are often accompanied by diplomatic initiatives. India seeks to garner international support to portray negative image of Pakistan globally.⁴³

Non-Kinetic Warfare

Non-Kinetic warfare refers to actions in a military or strategic context that do not involve direct physical force against an adversary's personnel or equipment. Unlike kinetic warfare, which involves the use of physical force, such as bombs, missiles, and gunfire to destroy or incapacitate, non-kinetic methods aim to achieve objectives through other means.⁴⁴

■ Indian Non-Kinetic Warfare Capabilities

Firstly, asymmetrical conflicts involving non-state actors supplement traditional state-centric warfare, challenging conventional military strategies. According to Pakistan's perspective, India supports proxy groups in regions along the India-Pakistan border and disputed territories, collaborating with the NDS post-Taliban regime downfall. Financing and arming proscribed organizations aim to promote terrorism in FATA, KP, and Balochistan, creating instability without direct military confrontation, facilitating strategic maneuvering.⁴⁵ India supports insurgencies within Pakistani borders, particularly in regions like Balochistan.⁴⁶

⁴⁰Abeer Iftikhar Tahirkheli, "India's Strategic Force Modernization and Its Implications on Strategic Environment of Pakistan," *Strategic Thought* 4, no. 1 (2022), 171.

⁴¹Ahmad Ibrahim, "Kargil Conflict from a Nuclear Perspective," *Strafasia | Strategy, Analysis, News and Insight of Emerging Asia*, September 7, 2020, https://strafasia.com/kargil-conflict-from-a-nuclear-perspective/.

⁴²M. U. Khattak, Muhammad Khan, and Ghulam Qumber, "Evolution of New Indian Military Strategy: Implications for Pakistan," *Margalla Papers* 23, no. 1 (2019), 139.

⁴³Ashley J. Tellis, "Striking Asymmetries: Nuclear Transitions in Southern Asia," (2022).

⁴⁴ Martin G. Clemis, "Crafting Non-Kinetic Warfare: The Academic-Military Nexus in US Counterinsurgency Doctrine," *Small Wars & Insurgencies* 20, no. 1 (2009), 184.

⁴⁵Masud Ahmad Khan, "Indian Proxies in Pakistan," *The Nation*, 2022, https://www.nation.com.pk/16-May-2022/indian-proxies-in-pakistan.

⁴⁶ Mir Sherbaz Khetran, "Indian Interference in Balochistan," *Strategic Studies* 37, no. 3 (2017), 125.

The use of proxies and support for separatist movements poses challenges to Pakistan's internal security. Kulbhushan Jadhav's case exemplifies this, as he operated under India's RAW, aiming to destabilize Pakistan. This highlights the use of individuals or entities by one state to indirectly influence or conduct operations in another, aligning with the concept of proxy warfare.⁴⁷ The case of Kulbhushan Jadhav highlights the intertwined complexities and tensions in the India-Pakistan relationship, showcasing accusations of espionage and proxy warfare tactics, emblematic of larger geopolitical rivalries.

Secondly, India utilizes information warfare and hybrid tactics to shape global perceptions, portraying Pakistan as the aggressor and isolating it diplomatically. Leveraging social media and international news outlets, India garners international support by framing regional conflicts favorably. With technology-savvy audiences, campaigns like #BoycottPakistan and #SayNoToPakistaniArtists achieve widespread dissemination, magnifying Indian messaging and impacting public opinion worldwide. For instance, an NGO headquartered in Brussels, focused on countering disinformation against the European Union, discovered a 15-year-long initiative orchestrated by an Indian organization. This initiative involved the utilization of numerous fictitious media platforms and the appropriation of a deceased professor's identity to target Pakistan. ⁴⁹

Thirdly, the Indian false flag operation aims to divert attention from human rights abuses in Indian Illegally Occupied Jammu and Kashmir (IIOJK), accusing Pakistan of terrorism. The strategy involves staged events, like the Pulwama attack, before Indian elections, for political gains. Tensions escalated in 2019, leading to aerial clashes. Former IIOJK governor Satya Pal Malik implied Modi's awareness of the Pulwama attack.⁵⁰

⁴⁷Babar Khan Bozdar, "Kulbhushan Jadhav Case," *South Asia Journal*, May 2017. https://southasiajournal.net/kulbhushan-jadhav-case/.

⁴⁸Shafiq Khattak, "India's Cyber Prowess: A Strategic Challenge for Pakistan's Security," *Pakistan Today*, 2023, https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2023/03/28/indias-cyber-prowess-a-strategic-challenge-for-pakistans-security/.

⁴⁹ Bilal Kuchay, "EU NGO Report Uncovers Indian Disinformation Campaign," *Al-Jazeera*, December 11, 2020.

⁵⁰"PM Modi, NSA Doval Silenced Me on Security Lapses Leading to Pulwama Attack: Former J&K Governor Satya Pal Malik," *Frontline News Desk*, Apr 2023, https://frontline.thehindu.com/news/pm-modi-nsa-doval-silenced-me-on-security-lapses-leading-to-pulwama-attack-former-jk-governor-satyapal-malik/article66743512.ece.

The abrogation of articles 35A and 370 and the division of Jammu and Kashmir into union territories led to a military lockdown. Allegedly, India employs false flag operations to divert attention from internal issues, especially in Kashmir.⁵¹

India's diplomatic and economic strategies, including diplomatic isolation and economic sanctions, can indirectly impact Pakistan's national security. Moreover, India's lobbying within the Financial Action Task Force (FATF) against Pakistan aims to highlight concerns about its alleged support for terrorist organizations and inadequate measures against money laundering and terror financing. This pressure could lead to economic sanctions or diplomatic isolation, altering the security landscape in South Asia.⁵²

India's advances in cyber capabilities pose significant challenges for Pakistan, with potential cyber operations risking escalation and undermining Pakistan's security. Integrated into a broader hybrid warfare strategy, India has invested in cybersecurity research and infrastructure. Key entities like the National Cyber Security Coordinator (NCSC), Indian Computer Emergency Response Team (CERT-In), and National Critical Information Infrastructure Protection Centre (NCIIPC) signify India's commitment to safeguarding its cyberspace, raising concerns among neighboring nations, notably Pakistan, about information collection and cyber warfare capabilities.⁵³ In 2020, Pakistan Army reported a significant cyber-attack allegedly carried out by Indian intelligence agencies. According to Pakistani officials, Indian hackers have been increasingly targeting Pakistani websites, including those of government and financial institutions.⁵⁴

India's advances in cyber capabilities pose significant challenges for Pakistan, with potential cyber operations risking escalation and undermining Pakistan's security. Integrated into a broader hybrid warfare strategy, India has invested in cybersecurity research and infrastructure. Key entities like the National Cyber Security Coordinator (NCSC), Indian Computer Emergency

⁵¹Sajjad Shaukat, "Another False Flag Operation: Does Modi Want Atomic War?" *Pakistan Today*, September 2023, https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2023/09/18/another-false-flag-operation/.

⁵²Bukhtawer Parvaz, "Pakistan on FATF's Grey-List: India's Role," *Strafasia*, July 2021, https://strafasia.com/pakistan-on-fatfs-grey-list-indias-role/.

⁵³Saba Kiran, "A Comprehensive Study of India and Pakistan's Cyber Strengths and Weaknesses," *Modern Diplomacy*, 2023, https://moderndiplomacy.eu/2023/05/15/a-comprehensive-study-of-india-and-pakistans-cyber-strengths-and-weaknesses/.

⁵⁴"Major Cyber Attack by Indian Intelligence Identified: ISPR," The Express Tribune, August 12, 2020, https://tribune.com.pk/story/2259193/major-cyber-attack-by-indian-intelligence-identified-ispr.

Response Team (CERT-In), and National Critical Information Infrastructure Protection Centre (NCIIPC) signify India's commitment to safeguarding its cyberspace, raising concerns among neighboring nations, notably Pakistan, about information collection and cyber warfare capabilities.⁵⁵ In 2020, Pakistan Army reported a significant cyber-attack allegedly carried out by Indian intelligence agencies. According to Pakistani officials, Indian hackers have been increasingly targeting Pakistani websites, including those of government and financial institutions.⁵⁶

National Security Implications for Pakistan

The relationship between India and Pakistan is complex, with both countries having historical grievances and ongoing tensions.⁵⁷ From Pakistan's perspective, the evolving warfare techniques of India have multifaceted implications for the bilateral relations between the two countries, as well as for Pakistan's national security and regional stability. The nuanced and dynamic nature of India's military advancements, particularly in the domains of nuclear capabilities, kinetic and non-kinetic warfare, and hybrid strategies, necessitates a comprehensive evaluation and strategic recalibration by Pakistan.⁵⁸

The evolving nature of conflict between India and Pakistan, particularly in light of India's enhancements in both kinetic and non-kinetic military capabilities, presents intricate security dilemmas for Pakistan. These developments necessitate a comprehensive reevaluation of Pakistan's national security strategy to mitigate emerging threats and sustain regional peace.⁵⁹

The rapid militarization and modernization efforts by India, encompassing advancements in autonomous weaponry, missile technology, and space capabilities. It risks widening the conventional capability chasm between the two nations. Such a progression threatens to undermine

⁵⁵Saba Kiran, "A Comprehensive Study of India and Pakistan's Cyber Strengths and Weaknesses," *Modern Diplomacy*, 2023, https://moderndiplomacy.eu/2023/05/15/a-comprehensive-study-of-india-and-pakistans-cyber-strengths-and-weaknesses/.

⁵⁶"Major Cyber Attack by Indian Intelligence Identified: ISPR," The Express Tribune, August 12, 2020, https://tribune.com.pk/story/2259193/major-cyber-attack-by-indian-intelligence-identified-ispr.

⁵⁷Brigadier Syed Mushtaq Ahmed, "Pakistan & India: Instability for South Asia," *Paradigm Shift*, April 3, 2023, https://www.paradigmshift.com.pk/pakistan-india-south-asia/.

⁵⁸ Major General Noe Israel Khokhar, "Non-Kinetic Challenges to the State of Pakistan," Islamabad: National Defence University, February 2012, p. 81.

⁵⁹Ejaz Haider, "Can Pakistan-India Nuclear Deterrence Hold?" *Asia News Network* (blog), May 29, 2023, https://asianews.network/can-pakistan-india-nuclear-deterrence-hold/.

the credibility of Pakistan's conventional deterrence against India, thereby jeopardizing the regional balance of power.⁶⁰

In addition, the growing indigenous missile defense capabilities of India, exemplified by the acquisition of systems like S-400, potentially compromise the effectiveness of Pakistan's nuclear deterrent. In response, Pakistan may feel compelled to augment the credibility of its strategic deterrence through advancements in its nuclear weapons and missile technologies, potentially igniting an arms race.⁶¹

Furthermore, India's ambitions to augment its cyber and space warfare capabilities could leave Pakistan susceptible to cyber-attacks and espionage, threatening both economic stability and the integrity of its national security infrastructure. The prospect of targeted strikes against critical governmental and financial institutions represents a significant concern. ⁶²

Moreover, accusations of India's support for separatist movements and engagement in proxy warfare within Pakistan exacerbate the internal security landscape. Islamabad is thus obligated to allocate substantial resources away from conventional military preparedness towards counterinsurgency efforts and bolstering internal security, with the aim of thwarting efforts to destabilize Pakistan from within.⁶³

In addition, Efforts by India to malign Pakistan on international platforms by levying accusations of terrorist financing and other malign activities, if encountered, could lead to Pakistan's economic and diplomatic isolation. This strategy, coupled with lobbying in forums such as FATF, has the potential to significantly impact Pakistan's international standing and economic security. In confronting these challenges, Pakistan must prioritize military modernization, diplomatic engagement, and the reinforcement of internal security measures.⁶⁴

⁶⁰ Muhammad Usama Ali, "Indian Military Modernization and Threat to South Asia Strategic Stability," *Global Village Space*, September 10, 2021, https://www.globalvillagespace.com/threats-of-indian-military-modernization-on-south-asian-strategic-stability/.

 ⁶¹ Shaza Arif, "India's Acquisition of the S-400 Air Defense System," *Journal of Indo-Pacific Affairs*, Fall (2021), 54.
 ⁶² Ms Nageen Ashraf and Saima Ashraf Kayani, "India's Cyber Warfare Capabilities: Repercussions for Pakistan's National Security," *NDU Journal* 37 (2023), 45.

⁶³ Zahid Hussain, "India's Proxy War against Pakistan," Arab News PK, July 4, 2020, https://arab.news/9s4sh.

⁶⁴ Zainab Yasin, "India Politicizing International Forums to Malign Pakistan," *Centre for Strategic and Contemporary Research (blog)*, December 6, 2022, https://cscr.pk/explore/themes/defense-security/india-politicizing-international-forums-to-malign-pakistan/.

Way Forward

In response to the Indian military modernization, there is a need of a comprehensive modernization of Pakistan's armed forces, particularly in domains of conventional and unconventional warfare, is imperative. Investments in cyber warfare capabilities, missile technologies, and anti-missile systems are crucial to preserve the strategic balance. Additionally, fostering indigenous military manufacturing capabilities can enhance self-reliance and reduce dependence on external suppliers.

In addition, Pakistan should persist in fortifying its nuclear deterrent capabilities to maintain their credibility, even as India enhances its missile defense capacities. This encompasses the development of MIRVs technology, augmentation of second-strike capabilities, and ensuring the survivability of its nuclear arsenal. Furthermore, a pronounced focus on the development of cyber defense mechanisms and investment in space technology for communication, surveillance, and reconnaissance is essential. Collaboration between the public and private sectors is pivotal in safeguarding national interests in the domains of space and cyber.

Moreover, strengthening the internal security framework and intelligence capabilities is vital for effectively addressing insurgency and proxy warfare within its borders. Comprehensive antiterrorism strategies, inclusive of social and economic development programs, are necessary to address the root causes of extremism and separatism.

Furthermore, proactive engagement with the international community is required to counteract India's attempts to tarnish Pakistan's image and diplomatically isolate it. Establishing robust relationships with regional and global powers, leveraging platforms such as the Organization of Islamic Cooperation, and participating in international forums to articulate Pakistan's stance on regional security issues are critical.

In addition, the foundation of national security is a robust economy. Prioritizing the improvement of trade relations, attracting foreign investment, and implementing economic reforms are essential for Pakistan. Addressing FATF concerns comprehensively, is crucial to enhancing its international financial standing and avoiding sanctions. Engaging in dialogue with India over enduring disputes, such as Kashmir, is imperative for long-term regional peace.

Confidence-building measures, fostering people-to-people connections, and bilateral dialogues can lay the groundwork for coexistence and mutual understanding.

In summary, Pakistan's national security policy must be adaptive, multifaceted, and forward-looking to effectively navigate the evolving security landscape shaped by India's military advancements and strategic postures.

Conclusion

There is a complex picture of changing nature of warfare between India and Pakistan is emerging, highlighting the multifaceted challenges posed by the advancements in military technologies, doctrines, and strategies. The evolution from traditional kinetic warfare to sophisticated hybrid warfare tactics, incorporating cyber-attacks and information warfare, represents a significant shift in the strategic calculus of the region. India's military modernization, including developments in missile technology, space capabilities, and cyber warfare, alongside its strategic doctrines such as CSD, poses new security dilemmas for Pakistan. In response, Pakistan must recalibrate its security strategies, focusing on enhancing its deterrence capabilities, modernizing its armed forces, and strengthening its cyber and space defense mechanisms. Furthermore, the internal security challenges posed by non-kinetic warfare tactics and proxy conflicts necessitate a comprehensive approach that includes strengthening internal security frameworks, countering insurgency, and addressing the root causes of extremism. Diplomatic engagement and international cooperation emerge as crucial components in mitigating the risks of isolation and economic sanctions, underscoring the importance of a multi-dimensional strategy that combines military readiness with diplomatic, economic, and social initiatives.